Results of a desk study on best practices for animal transport

M.A. Mitchell and H.A.M. Spoolder
Protection of animals in transit


• The EU legislation relating to animal transportation was last updated by Council Regulation (EC) No 1/2005 on the protection of animals during transport.
The current European position

- EC 1/2005 “The Transport Regulation”
- Implemented 2007
- Transport of ALL animals
- Fitness to travel
- Journey times, feeding and watering intervals, stocking densities
- Thermal envelopes / Temperature limits
- Vehicle standards
- Competencies / transporter authorisations
Overview of Regulation

• Journeys over 8 hours
• Additional requirements
  - authorisation
  - stricter vehicle standards
  - vehicle inspection and approval
  - competent
Identified recommendations for improvement and development
Impact of the Regulation - SANCO (2011)

- The Regulation has had beneficial impact on the welfare of animals during transport, but there is room for improvement of the situation.
- An amendment of the Regulation is not the most appropriate approach to address the identified problems.
- As regards the gap between the requirements of the legislation and available scientific evidence the Commission sees that this is best addressed by the adoption of guides to good practice.
Protection of animals in transit

- The development of Guides to Good Practice is a key objective also of FVO as indicated in the Work Plan of 2015.
Transport Guides

Therefore a project was commissioned by DG SANTE to produce Guides to Good Practice for cattle, sheep, pigs, horses and poultry in the European Union

“Transport Guides”

http://animaltransportguides.eu/
Guides to Good Practice

• ‘Transport Guides’ aims to develop Guides to Good Practice on the transportation of livestock species (horses, poultry, pigs, sheep and cattle) in the European Union

• Additionally the project will carry out different dissemination activities in order to enhance a uniform level of implementation of the existing legislation
Research Consortium

- 16 Representative organisations
- 9 Member States
- Stakeholder platform with 10 member organisations
Participating countries
**Project overview**

**Task 1**
Data collection

**Task 2**
Draft Guides

**Task 3**
Final Guides

**Task 4**
Dissemination

**Task 5**
Verification

Data collection by the whole consortium in all relevant countries

Design of structure via Multi Criteria Mapping by representatives of EU stakeholders

Agreement on final content with representatives of EU stakeholders

Focus on 8 target countries

Dissemination plan

Impact assessment questionnaire

2 duo countries / species

cattle
pigs
horses
sheep
poultry

Delphi to agree content in stakeholder Working Groups
Task 1

- The first phase of this project involved the examination of a wide range of information sources and literature to identify and evaluate available recommendations for good and best practices during all stages of transport of livestock
Operational definitions and objectives

• It is essential that we have consistent operational definitions of what we mean by “good practice” for purposes of completing
Operational definitions and objectives

• **Good practices**: procedures and processes that ensure compliance with requirements of legislation designed to protect the animals’ welfare. Such practices and associated Standard Operating Procedures or Guidelines are not necessarily aimed at improving animal welfare above the minimum legal requirements. Good Practices are particularly important where the current legislation is insufficient to identify the intended minimum welfare standard (e.g. because the formulation is too vague, or because a specific aspect has been neglected).

• **Best Practices**: providing additional guidance on how procedures and operations can be improved to exceed any legally defined minimum welfare requirements and to increase the welfare status of the animals during the relevant periods and procedures.
Objective of Task 1

• The primary objective of Task 1 was:-

To collect, collate, review and appraise and evaluate all appropriate scientific knowledge, existing guides / protocols, and relevant experience to support the development of Transport Guides
Description of Task 1

- The species defined sub-groups are
  - Poultry: Itavi (France) and HAO-VRI (Greece)
  - Cattle: Idele (France) and SRUC (UK)
  - Horses: IZS (Italy) and WLR (The Netherlands)
  - Sheep: USAMVBT (Romania) and IRTA (Spain)
  - Pigs: CRPA (Italy) and IFIP (France)
Sources of information

- Advice documents, guidance, guidelines, code of practice issued by Competent Authorities (CAs), veterinarians, Non Governmental Organisations or other stakeholder and industry groups including animal transporters, slaughterhouse operators, processors breeding companies, trade bodies and retailer guides and Quality Assurance schemes
- Research organisations and training centres provided further information concerning existing codes of practice, Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) and guides to good practice
- Scientific and technical literature, EFSA Scientific Opinions
- Information and guides to good or best practice were identified in third countries including North and South America, Canada, Australia and New Zealand and European (non-EU) countries

The period covered by the search was the last 20 years (post 1996)
Total number of sources examined

- Over 1500 potential primary sources were identified and examined.
- The number of available/usable information sources and recommended practices varied greatly depending upon the species investigated.
- A total of 190 sources were selected for inclusion. Several of these refer to more than one species of livestock.
Preliminary findings

• Data and recommended practices have been identified for all species (included in draft guides)

• The majority of the sources of these recommendations are freely available online, and directly accessible to a large international audience

• There is little information on the impact of existing recommendations for Good Practice upon actual practice
Preliminary findings

- Available guidelines relating to means of transport are often generic, and apply to all species.
- There is general consensus in terms of vehicle design, particularly in relation to ventilation, but there is a lack of detailed information on how to operate these systems.
- There is little advice on design and operation of on-board drinker (or feeder) system for use on long journeys.
Preliminary findings

• There is little information available on good and best practices regarding emergency situations and driving skills
• There is also a lack of specific advice on practices relating to "long journeys" and the associated rest stops
• Only limited recommendations are available on documentation to be carried on board vehicles or relating to contingency plans.
• There is a lack of standardised training available in all areas
Training courses

• Better Training for Safer Food program (BTSF), are train-the-trainer workshops aimed at official veterinarians (Welfare during Transport)

• The feedback of more than 150 delegates suggests that the great majority (87%) of trained persons were positive to very positive about the course

- They indicate to have learned new knowledge and competences which make an impact on their behaviour during official controls and inspections. When asked, they preferred field activities in both the Basic as well as the Advanced training courses (43% and 75%), followed by traditional class training (35% and 12%). Less preferred was eLearning (22% and 13%). The trainees were asked if they initiated cascade training activities in their own countries after attending the BTSF course on animal welfare, and 65% responded positively.
Training courses

• FVE and the European Commission also organised 9 practical training workshops for veterinarians on animal welfare topics across Europe. These workshops were ‘train the trainer’ events, with over 1100 participants (mostly veterinarians)
Training courses

• A survey among stakeholder groups related to the Transport Guides project

• What information sources are most use?

• Which sources had the highest impact on their work?
Training courses

- Replies were received from 40 persons of which 5 were transporters, 2 vehicle manufacturers, 5 official veterinarians, 6 farmers, 3 giving training to drivers, 7 private veterinary surgeons, 7 from animal welfare NGO’s. The remaining 5 unaffiliated
## Training courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>AW NGO</th>
<th>Driver trainer</th>
<th>Farmer</th>
<th>Official vet</th>
<th>Trans-porter</th>
<th>Truck manufacturer</th>
<th>Vet</th>
<th>Grand Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminars</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-learning</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines/factsheets</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tech workshops</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On-site training</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Videos</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPs</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On job training</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online training</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cert. of Competence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total responses</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Training courses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training Courses</th>
<th>AW NGO</th>
<th>Driver trainer</th>
<th>Farmer</th>
<th>Official vet</th>
<th>Transporter</th>
<th>Truck manufacturer</th>
<th>Vet</th>
<th>Grand Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>On-site training</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tech workshops</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>On job training</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guidelines/factsheets</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminars</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cert. of Competence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-learning</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Videos</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOPs</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online training</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total responses</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training courses

• We conclude that
  - Hands-on training (on the job, through technical workshops or on-site) is considered most effective.
  - Stakeholders on the ‘working floor’ learn most from other colleagues with direct and relevant experience.
  - Guidelines and fact sheets highly valued very much, in particular if they are practical and illustrative.
Summary 1

- Current European welfare legislation relating to animal transport is adequate but contains some inconsistencies and omissions
- Implementation of the Regulation is “patchy”, inconsistent and non-uniform
- It is difficult to effectively apply and enforce outwith the European Union
- There will be no major revisions or amendments to the Regulation in the immediate future
- It is proposed that the way forward is to produce and develop Guides to Good or Best Practice
Summary 2

• These should complement and support current legislation
• The guides should be based on all current practical knowledge, experience and scientific information
• The Guides should be developed in consultation with all appropriate stakeholders at every stage
• The Guides should be scrutinised and approved by stakeholders prior to publication
• The Guides should be coupled to appropriate dissemination and training
Summary 3

• Good Practice will ensure more uniform compliance with Legislation and the prescribed welfare standards across Europe (and beyond?)

• Best practice will encourage and support achievement of higher welfare standards that exceed current legislation minima
Summary 4

• 190 information sources have been identified and included as the basis for Draft Guides to Good and Best Practices for Animal Transport

• Industry concerns and requirements have been reviewed and the findings subjected to a Delphi exercise

• The proposed draft Guides have been developed for each species and forwarded to the stakeholder community
Summary 5

• Following a further stakeholder consultation meeting (September 7th – Brussels) we will move to development of the Final Guides

• Watch this space!!!!

http://animaltransportguides.eu/

Poster 43.18 Horse_Transport
All 16 partners
Network document on the Welfare of Poultry During Transport to Slaughter